## TEXAS TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

**ALL Counties** 

## MINUTE ORDER

Page 1 of 1

**ALL** Districts

The Texas Transportation Commission (commission) finds it necessary to propose new §§1.101 - 1.108, relating to Alternative Dispute Resolution, to be codified under Title 43, Texas Administrative Code, Part 1.

The preamble and the proposed new sections, attached to this minute order as Exhibits A and B, are incorporated by reference as though set forth verbatim in this minute order, except that they are subject to technical corrections and revisions, approved by the General Counsel, necessary for compliance with state or federal law or for acceptance by the Secretary of State for filing and publication in the *Texas Register*.

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED by the commission that new §§1.101 - 1.108 are proposed for adoption and are authorized for publication in the *Texas Register* for the purpose of receiving public comments.

The executive director is directed to take the necessary steps to implement the actions as ordered in this minute order, pursuant to the requirements of the Administrative Procedure Act, Government Code, Chapter 2001.

Submitted and reviewed by:

General Counsel

Recommended by

Execut 13134 JUL 26 12

Minute Number Date Passed 1 Proposed Preamble

- 2 The Texas Department of Transportation (department) proposes new
- 3 Subchapter G, Alternative Dispute Resolution, §§1.101-1.108.
- 4 These rules are proposed concurrently with amendments to Title
- 5 43, Texas Administrative Code (TAC), §9.1, and new §9.7,
- 6 concerning contract claims and protests.

7

- 8 EXPLANATION OF PROPOSED NEW SECTIONS
- 9 Senate Bill 1420, 82nd Legislature, Regular Session, 2011, the
- 10 department's sunset bill, added Transportation Code, §201.118,
- 11 which in part contains the Sunset Commission's across-the-board
- 12 provision that requires the Texas Transportation Commission
- 13 (commission) to develop and implement a policy to encourage the
- 14 use of appropriate alternative dispute resolution procedures
- 15 under Government Code, Chapter 2009, to assist in the resolution
- 16 of internal and external disputes under the department's
- 17 jurisdiction. The statute requires the department's alternative
- 18 dispute resolution procedures to conform as much as possible to
- 19 model guidelines issued by the State Office of Administrative
- 20 Hearings for the use of alternative dispute resolution by a
- 21 state agency. Government Code, Chapter 2009, adopts some of the
- 22 qualifications and requirements of Civil Practice and Remedies
- 23 Code, Chapter 154, which relates to the alternative dispute
- 24 resolution procedures used by the courts of this state.

- 1 New §1.101, Definitions, provides definitions used within the
- 2 subchapter. The section contains a definition for "impartial
- 3 third party" which is the individual who conducts an alternative
- 4 dispute resolution process.

- 6 New §1.102, Policy, states the policy for the subchapter which
- 7 is to encourage the use, if appropriate, of an alternative
- 8 dispute resolution process to resolve a dispute under the
- 9 department's jurisdiction.

10

- 11 New §1.103, Alternative Dispute Resolution Description, provides
- 12 a general description of an alternative dispute resolution with
- 13 a listing of the types of processes used.

14

- 15 New §1.104, Impartial Third Party, provides the qualifications
- 16 and standards for an impartial third party, as required by
- 17 statute.

- 19 New §1.105, Alternative Dispute Resolution Coordinator, requires
- 20 the executive director of the department to designate an
- 21 employee as the department's alternative dispute resolution
- 22 coordinator. The section requires the coordinator to satisfy
- 23 the statutory requirements for an impartial third party and,
- 24 therefore, the coordinator is permitted to serve as an impartial
- 25 third party in an alternative dispute resolution process in

- 1 which the department is a party if approved by all other parties
- 2 to the process. Subsection (d) requires the alternative dispute
- 3 resolution coordinator to develop the process to be used by the
- 4 department for alternative dispute resolution, including the
- 5 selection of an impartial third party. The process must
- 6 conform, to the extent possible, to the model guidelines issued
- 7 by the State Office of Administrative Hearings for the use of
- 8 alternative dispute resolution by state agencies, as required by
- 9 Transportation Code, §201.118(b). In accordance with
- 10 Transportation Code, §201.118(c), subsection (e) requires the
- 11 alternative dispute resolution coordinator to collect data on
- 12 the effectiveness of the department's use of alternative dispute
- 13 resolution and to report the results to the commission.
- 15 New §1.106, Use of Alternative Dispute Resolution, provides that
- 16 alternative dispute resolution may be used to resolve a dispute
- 17 relating to the department unless a rule of the commission
- 18 specifically provides otherwise. The procedure provided under
- 19 new Subchapter G may not be used for employee disputes,
- 20 disciplinary actions, grievances, and appeals, contract claims,
- 21 protests in connection with the solicitation, evaluation, or
- 22 award of a purchase of commodities or non-professional services
- 23 under the State Purchasing and General Services Act (Government
- 24 Code, Title 10, Subtitle D), or requests for the review of
- 25 decisions that are final or not reviewable under Title 43 of the

OGC: 07/18/12 1:37 PM

- 1 Texas Administrative Code or for which Title 43 provides an
- 2 exclusive appeals process. The procedures used for resolving
- 3 some of those disputes may provide for the use of alternative
- 4 dispute resolution, but Subchapter G does not apply to those
- 5 disputes. For example, under the proposed rule a request for
- 6 alternative dispute resolution could be made concerning bid
- 7 protests related to a highway improvement contract, or related
- 8 to a contract for architectural, engineering, or surveying
- 9 services.

- 11 New §1.107, Assessment for the Use of Alternative Dispute
- 12 Resolution, requires the alternative dispute resolution
- 13 coordinator to assess whether an alternative dispute resolution
- 14 process is appropriate for a dispute that is referred to the
- 15 coordinator for the use of alternative dispute resolution. If
- 16 appropriate, the coordinator determines the type of process to
- 17 be used. While the use of alternative dispute resolution is
- 18 encouraged, it is not appropriate for all disputes. The new
- 19 section provides some examples of when the use of an alternative
- 20 dispute resolution process is not appropriate.

- 22 New §1.108, Confidentiality of Certain Records and
- 23 Communications, states that the confidentiality provisions of
- 24 Civil Practice and Remedies Code, §154.073 apply for an
- 25 alternative dispute resolution process.

- 2 FISCAL NOTE
- 3 James Bass, Chief Financial Officer, has determined that for
- 4 each of the first five years in which the new sections as
- 5 proposed are in effect, there will be no fiscal implications for
- 6 state or local governments as a result of enforcing or
- 7 administering the new sections.

8

- 9 Jeff Graham, General Counsel, has certified that there will be
- 10 no significant impact on local economies or overall employment
- 11 as a result of enforcing or administering the new sections.

12

- 13 PUBLIC BENEFIT AND COST
- 14 Mr. Graham has also determined that for each year of the first
- 15 five years in which the sections are in effect, the public
- 16 benefit anticipated as a result of enforcing or administering
- 17 the new sections will be to encourage the use of appropriate
- 18 alternative dispute resolution procedures by the department and
- 19 to clarify the procedure used for contract claims involving the
- 20 department. There are no anticipated economic costs for persons
- 21 required to comply with the sections as proposed. There will be
- 22 no adverse economic effect on small businesses.

23

- 24 SUBMITTAL OF COMMENTS
- 25 Written comments on the proposed new §§1.101-1.108 may be

OGC: 07/18/12 1:37 PM

- 1 submitted to Robin Carter, Office of General Counsel, Texas
- 2 Department of Transportation, 125 East 11th Street, Austin,
- 3 Texas 78701-2483 or through RuleComments@txdot.gov with the
- 4 subject line "§§1.101-1.108.". The deadline for receipt of
- 5 comments is 5:00 p.m. on September 10, 2012. In accordance with
- 6 Transportation Code, §201.811(a)(5), a person who submits
- 7 comments must disclose, in writing with the comments, whether
- 8 the person does business with the department, may benefit
- 9 monetarily from the proposed new sections, or is an employee of
- 10 the department.

- 12 STATUTORY AUTHORITY
- 13 The new sections are proposed under Transportation Code,
- 14 §201.101, which provides the commission with the authority to
- 15 establish rules for the conduct of the work of the department,
- 16 and more specifically, Transportation Code, §201.118, which in
- 17 part requires the commission to develop and implement a policy
- 18 to encourage the use of appropriate alternative dispute
- 19 resolution procedures to assist in the resolution of internal
- 20 and external disputes under the department's jurisdiction.

21

- 22 CROSS REFERENCE TO STATUTE
- 23 Transportation Code, §201.118.

OGC: 07/18/12 1:37 PM

- 1 SUBCHAPTER G. ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION
- 2 §1.101. Definitions. The following words and terms, when used
- 3 in this subchapter, have the following meanings, unless the
- 4 context clearly indicates otherwise.
- 5 (1) Commission--The Texas Transportation Commission.
- 6 (2) Department--The Texas Department of Transportation.
- 7 (3) Executive director--The executive director of the
- 8 Texas Department of Transportation.

- 10 §1.102. Policy. In accordance with Transportation Code,
- 11 §201.118, the commission encourages the use of appropriate
- 12 alternative dispute resolution processes to assist in the
- 13 resolution of internal and external disputes under the
- 14 department's jurisdiction.

15

- 16 §1.103. Alternative Dispute Resolution Description.
- 17 Alternative dispute resolution uses a wide variety of processes
- 18 that may be informal or formal and that are intended to achieve
- 19 conflict resolution through agreement of the parties to the
- 20 conflict. Those processes include non-binding arbitration,
- 21 collaborative problem-solving, conciliation, consensus building,
- 22 and mediation, and may consist of a combination of two or more
- 23 of those or other dispute resolution processes. An alternative

- 1 dispute resolution process is conducted by an individual who is
- 2 referred to as an impartial third party.

- 4 §1.104. Impartial Third Party.
- 5 (a) A person may not act as an impartial third party unless
- 6 the person has the qualifications specified in Civil Practice
- 7 and Remedies Code, §154.052 and has no personal interest or
- 8 stake in the outcome of the dispute.
- 9 (b) An impartial third party is subject to the standards
- 10 and duties prescribed by Civil Practice and Remedies Code,
- 11 §154.053.
- 12 (c) To serve as the impartial third party for an
- 13 alternative dispute resolution process, a person must be
- 14 approved by the parties to the process.

15

- 16 §1.105. Alternative Dispute Resolution Coordinator.
- 17 (a) The executive director shall designate a department
- 18 employee as the department's alternative dispute resolution
- 19 coordinator.
- 20 (b) The person designated as the alternative dispute
- 21 resolution coordinator must have completed a minimum of 40
- 22 classroom hours of training in dispute resolution techniques in
- 23 a course conducted by an alternative dispute resolution system

- 1 established under Civil Practice and Remedies Code, Chapter 152,
- 2 or another dispute resolution organization approved by a court
- 3 of this state at the time of or as soon as practicable after the
- 4 designation.
- 5 (c) The alternative dispute resolution coordinator may act
- 6 as the impartial third party for an alternative dispute
- 7 resolution process.
- 8 (d) The alternative dispute resolution coordinator shall
- 9 develop the process to be used by the department for alternative
- 10 dispute resolution. The process must conform, to the extent
- 11 possible, to the model guidelines issued by the State Office of
- 12 Administrative Hearings for the use of alternative dispute
- 13 resolution by state agencies. The process should provide the
- 14 method that will be used by the coordinator for the selection of
- 15 impartial third parties.

- 16 (e) The alternative dispute resolution coordinator shall
- 17 collect data on the effectiveness of the department's use of
- 18 alternative dispute resolution and before December 31 of each
- 19 year shall file with the commission a report interpreting the
- 20 data collected for the preceding fiscal year.
- 22 §1.106. Use of Alternative Dispute Resolution.
- 23 (a) Alternative dispute resolution is available for a

- 1 dispute relating to the department unless a rule of the
- 2 commission provides an exclusive procedure to address that type
- 3 of dispute or specifically provides that alternative dispute
- 4 resolution will not be used for that type of dispute.
- 5 (b) The alternative dispute resolution procedure provided
- 6 under this subchapter is not applicable to:
- 7 (1) employee disputes, disciplinary actions, grievances,
- 8 and appeals, all of which are subject to the department's Human
- 9 Resources Manual;
- 10 (2) contract claims, which are subject to the procedures
- 11 provided by §9.1 or §9.2 of this title (relating to Contract
- 12 Claims under Government Code, Chapter 2260 or Contract Claim
- 13 Procedure, respectively);
- 14 (3) protests in connection with the solicitation,
- 15 evaluation, or award of a purchase of commodities or non-
- 16 professional services under the State Purchasing and General
- 17 Services Act (Government Code, Title 10, Subtitle D), which are
- 18 subject to §9.3 (relating to Protest of Department Purchases
- 19 under the State Purchasing and General Services Act); or
- 20 (4) appeals, regardless of how denominated, that request
- 21 the review of decisions that are final or not reviewable under
- 22 this title or for which this title provides an exclusive appeals
- 23 process.

- 2 §1.107. Assessment of the Use of Alternative Dispute
- 3 Resolution.
- 4 (a) When the alternative dispute resolution coordinator
- 5 receives a referral or request for the use of alternative
- 6 dispute resolution, the coordinator will assess whether an
- 7 alternative dispute resolution process is appropriate for the
- 8 dispute and, if so, will determine the type of process that is
- 9 most likely to result in an agreement.
- 10 (b) Reasons that the coordinator may determine that the use
- 11 of an alternative dispute resolution process is not appropriate
- 12 include:
- 13 (1) previous determinations concerning the matter in
- 14 dispute provide a clearly established precedent for resolving
- 15 the matter;
- 16 (2) the use of an alternative dispute resolution process
- 17 is an inefficient use of the department's resources compared to
- 18 other processes that may be used to resolve the dispute;
- 19 (3) the dispute involves significant unresolved legal
- 20 issues that must be resolved before an alternative dispute
- 21 resolution process is likely to be effective;
- 22 (4) the dispute significantly affects organizations or
- 23 individuals who would not be participants in the process and

- 1 whose interests would not be adequately represented by
- 2 participants; and
- 3 (5) the use of an alternative dispute resolution process
- 4 cannot provide a public record of the proceeding, which is
- 5 important or necessary for the particular type of dispute.

- 7 §1.108. Confidentiality of Certain Records and Communications.
- 8 The confidentiality of a communication or record relating to an
- 9 alternative dispute resolution process is governed by Civil
- 10 Practice and Remedies Code, §154.073.